Launching the next generation of digital

disease surveillance tools

Mauricio Santillana

Faculty member, CHIP, Boston Children's Hospital Informatics Program *Associate*, Harvard Institute for Computational and Applied Sciences *Instructor*, Harvard Medical School







Beyond Google searches...



What are doctors searching for?





What are people tweeting? What are they reporting on crowd-sourced disease surveillance apps?



Can we use Electronic Health Records (EHR) to track disease incidence? What lab tests or medications are doctors prescribing?



What if we could get access to internet **searches** of **medical doctors** while in their practices (anonymously)?

Work with John Brownstein (HMS), Elaine Nsoesie (BCH, HMS), Sumiko Mekaru (BCH), David Scales (HMS)

UpToDate is a clinician's data base

English 🔹	Search UpToDa	ate	2 3.	Wolter Health	s Kluwer
	About Us	News & Events	Contact Us	<u>Help</u>	Log in

Smarter Decisions. Better Care.

UpToDate[®] is the premier evidence-based clinical decision support resource, trusted worldwide by healthcare practitioners to help them make the right decisions at the point of care. It is proven to change the way clinicians practice medicine, and is the only resource of its kind associated with improved outcomes.



UpToDate[®]

Hospitals or Institutions

Meet the standards of excellence that your institution demands and improve clinician satisfaction

Learn more »



Medical Professionals

98% of individual subscribers surveyed said they would recommend UpToDate to a colleague

Learn more »

Good reputation

"The data suggests the use of computerized tools such as UpToDate enable better decisions, better outcomes and better care." — Ashish Jha, M.D., M.P.H., Harvard, and Study Author

Widely used by clinicians: 700,000 clinicians in 158 countries, almost 90% of academic medical centers in the United States



Clinical Infectious Diseases

Using Clinicians' Search Query Data to Monitor Influenza Epidemics

Mauricio Santillana,^{1,2} Elaine O. Nsoesie,^{2,3} Sumiko R. Mekaru,² David Scales,^{2,4} and John S. Brownstein^{2,3,5}

¹School of Engineering and Applied Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, ²Children's Hospital Informatics Program, Boston Children's Hospital, ³Department of Pediatrics, Harvard Medical School, Boston, and ⁴Department of Internal Medicine, Cambridge Health Alliance, Massachusetts; and ⁵Department of Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Occupational Health, McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada

Search query information from a clinician's database, UpTo-Date, is shown to predict influenza epidemics in the United States in a timely manner. Our results show that digital disease surveillance tools based on experts' databases may be able to provide an alternative, reliable, and stable signal for accurate predictions of influenza outbreaks.

Keywords. digital disease detection; Internet-based disease surveillance; prediction of influenza.

validated traditional surveillance systems and have the potential to provide timely epidemiologic intelligence to inform prevention messaging and healthcare facility staffing decisions.

The potential for the public's search activity to be influenced by anxiety, fears, and rumors raises concerns regarding reliability [10–13]. Although recent revisions to GFT have shown that these concerns can be partially mitigated [13–15], shifting Internet-based surveillance from the entire public to subjectmatter experts may maintain timeliness while generating a more reliable and stable signal requiring much less data. A recent small retrospective study using data on queries to a Finnish primary care guidelines database demonstrated, for example, that disease-specific queries for Lyme disease, tularemia, and other infectious diseases correlated well with concurrent confirmed cases [16].

Here, we show that UpToDate (www.uptodate.com), a physician-authored clinical decision support Internet resource that is used by 700 000 clinicians in 158 countries and almost 90% of academic medical centers in the United States, can be used for syndromic surveillance of influenza. Specifically, we use UpTo-Date's search query activity related to ILI to design a timely sentinel of influenza incidence in the United States.



Santillana et al. Clinical Infectious Diseases, 2014 (Published online)



Santillana et al. Clinical Infectious Diseases, 2014 (Published online)

What if we could ask the general public if they are sick?

Working with Andre Nguyen (Harvard SEAS)







Launched in 2011

Working with Andre Nguyen (Harvard SEAS), Rumi Chunara, John Brownstein

1 🔳

0

https://flunearyou.org/



Flu Near You is a community health project for North America. Learn more about how it works 📀

National comparison with CDC



Time Series	Correlation	RMSE
FNY – raw	0.808	1.16
FNY – CDC adjusted	0.956	0.384

Regional comparisons with CDC



0.80 - 0.90

FNY – CDC adjusted

0.60 - 1.26

Correlation of FNY with flu information from CDC and Boston's Health Department



Plots produced by Kristin Baltrusaitis

Correlation of FNY with CDC. Multiple Geographic Scales



What if we had real-time access to **electronic health records**?

Work with: Andre Nguyen (Harvard SEAS), Tamara Louie (HSPH) John Brownstein (HMS), Iyue Sung (athenahealth)





Santillana et al. 2016 Scientific Reports, 25732

We can predict flu in finer geographic scales with amazing accuracy!



Santillana et al. 2016 Scientific Reports, 25732

Overall					
Data Utilized	Inclusion of AR Terms?	RMSE	Rel. RMSE (%)	Correlation	Algorithm
National					
GFT		1.03	32.91%	0.913	
% ILI	No	0.37	12.50%	0.981	Linear
% ILI, % viral, % flu visits	Yes	0.12	4.92%	0.994	SVM (linear)
Region 1					
GFT		1.33	55.16%	0.786	
% ILI	No	0.28	21.87%	0.960	Linear
% ILI, % viral, % flu visits	Yes	0.14	11.87%	0.973	SVM (linear)
Region 2					
GFT		1.15	34.35%	0.907	
% ILI	No	0.44	21.09%	0.903	Linear
% ILI, % viral, % flu visits	Yes	0.19	8.39%	0.980	SVM (linear)
Region 3					
GFT		1.06	56.18%	0.860	
% ILI	No	0.59	22.15%	0.981	Linear
% ILI, % viral, % flu visits	Yes	0.25	9.87%	0.987	SVM (linear)

10

-

-

-

Refining the spatial resolution...



Tracking Flu using twitter (Daily analysis in NYC)



Work with R. Nagar, Q. Yuan, C. Freifeld, A. Nojima, R. Chunara, and J. S. Brownstein

Natural Language Processing (Using geo-located tweets)

- Identified tweets containing "flu", "influenza", "gripe", "high fever"
- 2. Classified tweets in categories

Table 1. E	xamples of Classified Tweets
Label	Example Tweets
Irrelevant	The flu shot prevents hangovers, so going all out w/5 fingers of wait, it's "no drinking" that prevents
	hangovers? #toolate
	Romney: I would not put no flu zones over Syria. Military is not necessary in the conflict
	#debate2012
RISH	This flu is kicking my butt,2nd day off work. Hopefully I can win the battle because I'm losing sick
	days & amp; that might hurt my pockets later
	Maldito flu sueltame!!! ðŸ~«ðŸ-
RISM	Uhhh I think I might be getting the flu /:
	Creo que me va a dar Gripe :'(
RISL	Finally getting over a miserae flu.
	@boyXsupreme ik ik it's awful. the past two weeks darci and I have had the flu but thank god we're
	done with it. get lots of rest + tlc ðŸ'•
RIOH	When @CiaraAnnex3 has the flu Love you but stay the hell away <3
	Running on no sleep my poor daughter has the flu
RIOM	@giannarussso YOU PROB GOTS THE FLU!!, ariannas has it
	@YanieseRivera damn girl, do you have the flu?
RIOL	On day 6, son's #flu is gone. He threw open side door and screamed to the outside, "FREEDOM"!
	Then shoveled snow. I am miserable on day 3.
	@_AlexAlford she's good too, fortunately she never actually got the flu. just a fever for a day or two
RASH	I'd rather get the flu than get the flu shot, #JustSayin. No needles for me.
	The flu is an epidemic here and I volunteer at a preschool twice a week. If I don't get he flu it will be
	a miracle.
RASM	I survived more than a week in NYC without contracting the flu! Let's hope the plane ride home
	won't break me. Trying to stay healthy here.
	So glad to be back in NYC, but stay away from me you Flu filled city.
RASL	Ah yea flu shot acquired! (@ Duane Reade) http://t.co/RSR2B111
	Just got a flu shot and Tdap booster at @onemedical â€" if you'll be in close contact with an
	infant, consider taking these vaccines.
RAOH	Flu infections sweep America hospitalizing thousands and leaving 18 children dead of complications,
	http://t.co/Yf9eQikm
	19,000 flu cases across NY this week. I'm not leaving my house.
RAOM	Wash your hand. America sick girl. #influenza #SICKENING #cleanup http://t.co/MKdASaV9
	The latest figures from the CDC show that flu cases are still rising in the west. Listen to our newscast:
	http://t.co/0kCiyoP8
RAOL	#patient advice. #flu vaccine not only protects you but your community Too. Less outbreaks. U may
	survive the flu, but sicker people may not
	"@grubstreetny: Here's How New York Chefs Beat the Flu http://t.co/bV3pEZ2Câ€□ uuuuu
	for real?

Categories



First experiment: was done by hand ...

Nagar et al. (2014) Journal of Medical Internet Research. In press

Label	Example Tweets
Irrelevant	The flu shot prevents hangovers, so going all out w/5 fingers ofwait, it's "no drinking" that prevents
	hangovers? #toolate
	Romney: I would not put no flu zones over Syria. Military is not necessary in the conflict
	#debate2012
RISH	This flu is kicking my butt,2nd day off work. Hopefully I can win the battle because I'm losing sick
	days & amp; that might hurt my pockets later
	Maldito flu sueltame!!! ðÝ~«ðÝ~;
RISM	Uhhh I think I might be getting the flu /:
	Creo que me va a dar Gripe :'(
RISL	Finally getting over a miserae flu.
	@boyXsupreme ik ik it's awful. the past two weeks darci and I have had the flu but thank god we're done with it. get lots of rest + tlc ðŸ'•
RIOH	When @CiaraAnnex3 has the flu Love you but stay the hell away <3
	Running on no sleep my poor daughter has the flu
RIOM	@giannarussso YOU PROB GOTS THE FLU!!, ariannas has it
	@YanieseRivera damn girl, do you have the flu?
RIOL	On day 6, son's #flu is gone. He threw open side door and screamed to the outside, "FREEDOM"!
	Then shoveled snow. I am miserable on day 3.
	@_AlexAlford she's good too, fortunately she never actually got the flu. just a fever for a day or two
RASH	I'd rather get the flu than get the flu shot, #JustSayin. No needles for me.
	The flu is an epidemic here and I volunteer at a preschool twice a week. If I don't get he flu it will be
	a miracle.
RASM	I survived more than a week in NYC without contracting the flu! Let's hope the plane ride home
	won't break me. Trying to stay healthy here.
2 4 67	So glad to be back in NYC, but stay away from me you Flu filled city.
RASL	Ah yea flu shot acquired! (@ Duane Reade) http://t.co/RSR2BI11
	Just got a flu shot and Tdap booster at @onemedical â€" if you'II be in close contact with an
DAOU	infant, consider taking these vaccines.
RAOH	Flu infections sweep America hospitalizing thousands and leaving 18 children dead of complications,
	http://t.co/Y19eQikm
D 4 O 1 4	19,000 flu cases across NY this week. I'm not leaving my house.
RAOM	Wash your hand. America sick girl. #influenza #SICKENING #cleanup http://t.co/MKdASaV9
	The latest figures from the CDC show that flu cases are still rising in the west. Listen to our newscast: http://t.co/0kCiyoP8
RAOL	#patient advice. #flu vaccine not only protects you but your community Too. Less outbreaks. U may
	survive the flu, but sicker people may not

Table 1. Examples of Classified Tweets

Daily ILI visits (as reported by the NYC emergency department) compared to predicted ILI using twitter data



Nagar et al. (2014) Journal of Medical Internet Research. In press

Spatial Analysis

Primary Space-time Cluster for High Risk of Tweeting Infection-based Content using a Poisson Model, Aggregated by Week, with Content-based Covariate Weight in NYC (10/15/2012 - 5/10/2013)



Results obtained by SaTScan

Vaccine Sites Overlayed on Spatial Distribution for High Probability Flu Tweeters in New York City (2012-2013)



Nagar et al. (2014) Journal of Medical Internet Research. In press

We now have multiple independent ways to estimate flu activity nationally and regionally.

What do we do with **more and more** flu predictors?





Knowledge and Prediction

Movie selection prediction (millions of users)



Personalize





Factors: time of the day you are watching, day, location, previous movie you watched

Stock market price prediction

(multiple actors)

1.Fundamental Analysis

2. Time-series analysis





Stock Market Signals From Social Media



Multiple predictors using social media

Exhibit 1: GS US equity Sentiment Indicator suggests near-term downside risk to S&P 500 as of December 31, 2014



Source: Haver, CFTC, FactSet, and Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

Digital Disease Detection (millions of citizens worldwide)





C CCC Flue C CCCC

Vathenahealth

Products & Services









So, what do we do with multiple predictors?

One solution: Pick the best performing one!



OR



Combine information using a voting system or ensemble method! (Machine Learning)

Movie selection



Different algorithms find optimal suggestions

Combine predictions using voting system (ensemble)



Factors: time of the day you are watching, day, location, previous movie you watched

Stock Market Signals From Social Media



Combine information from all predictors and produce an accurate and robust prediction

Exhibit 1: GS US equity Sentiment Indicator suggests near-term downside risk to S&P 500 as of December 31, 2014





- 1. Fundamental analysis
- 2. Time-series analysis
- 3. Internet-based analysis



Breiman L. Stacked regressions. Machine Learning, 24, 49-64 (1996)

Digital Disease Detection (US case study)





Vathenahealth




Performance of individual data sources

	CORR	RMSE (%ILI)	Rel RMSE (%)	RMAE (%)	Hit Rate
FNY	0.948	0.385	15.9	39.3	65.9
ATH	0.977	0.351	14.1	36.7	77.7
GT	0.978	0.245	13.3	42.9	65.9
GFT	0.980	0.333	12.3	35.3	75.3
TWT	0.937	0.414	15.1	50.1	62.4
CDC Baseline	0.930	0.501	18.2	46.7	68.2
CDC Virology	0.923	-	-	-	69.4

Performance ensemble

	CORR	RMSE (%ILI)	Rel RMSE (%)	RMAE (%)	Hit Rate
FNY	0.948	0.385	15.9	39.3	65.9
ATH	0.977	0.351	14.1	36.7	77.7
GT	0.978	0.245	13.3	42.9	65.9
GFT	0.980	0.333	12.3	35.3	75.3
TWT	0.937	0.414	15.1	50.1	62.4
CDC Baseline	0.930	0.501	18.2	46.7	68.2
CDC Virology	0.923	-	-	_	69.4
SVM (RBF)	0.989	0.176	8.27	23.6	69.4

Performance ensemble

	CORR	RMSE (%ILI)	Rel RMSE (%)	RMAE (%)	Hit Rate
FNY	0.948	0.385	15.9	39.3	65.9
ATH	0.977	0.351	14.1	36.7	77.7
GT	0.978	0.245	13.3	42.9	65.9
GFT	0.980	0.333	12.3	35.3	75.3
TWT	0.937	0.414	15.1	50.1	62.4
CDC Baseline	0.930	0.501	18.2	46.7	68.2
CDC Virology	0.923	-	-	_	69.4
SVM (RBF)	0.989	0.176	8.27	23.6	69.4

Performance of individual data sources



Performance ensemble



Real time predictions and Forecasts



Real time predictions and Forecasts



We are launching the next generation of digital disease surveillance tools

ARGO Prediction vs. CDC's ILI



Video produced by Shihao Yang

ARGO Prediction vs. CDC's ILI



SealthMap Flu Trends





Thanks to Sue Aman, Rachel Chorney, Jeff Andre, Andre Nguyen, John Brownstein and Healthmap team!



Boston Children's Hospital Until every child is well



PrealthMap Flu Trends



About







About

We will extend out methodology to finer spatial resolutions. Pilot projects:

- 1. State level: Massachusetts
 - 1. City level: Boston

With:

Suqin Hou, Fred Lu, Kristin Baltrusaitis, Joe Conidi, Julia Gunn, Jared Hawkins, John Brownstein.

Using multiple data sources to track flu in Boston



Using multiple data sources to **forecast** flu in **Boston**



Beyond flu...





Dengue and Zika



COUNTRIES WITH CONFIRMED ZIKA CASES





Evaluation of Internet-Based Dengue Query Data: Google Dengue Trends

Rebecca Tave Gluskin¹*, Michael A. Johansson², Mauricio Santillana³, John S. Brownstein¹

1 Children's Hospital Informatics Program, Children's Hospital Boston, Boston, Massachusetts, United States of America, 2 Dengue Branch, Division of Vector-Borne Diseases, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, San Juan, Puerto Rico, 3 School of Engineering and Applied Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States of America

PLOS NEGLECTED

While Google Dengue Trends captures well the national incidence of disease



Evaluation of Internet-Based Dengue Query Data: Google Dengue Trends

Rebecca Tave Gluskin¹*, Michael A. Johansson², Mauricio Santillana³, John S. Brownstein¹

1 Children's Hospital Informatics Program, Children's Hospital Boston, Boston, Massachusetts, United States of America, 2 Dengue Branch, Division of Vector-Borne Diseases, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, San Juan, Puerto Rico, 3 School of Engineering and Applied Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States of America

PLOS | NEGLECTED TROPICAL DISEASES

It fails to captures the incidence of dengue at the state level in multiple cases



Evaluation of Internet-Based Dengue Query Data: Google Dengue Trends

Rebecca Tave Gluskin¹*, Michael A. Johansson², Mauricio Santillana³, John S. Brownstein¹

1 Children's Hospital Informatics Program, Children's Hospital Boston, Boston, Massachusetts, United States of America, 2 Dengue Branch, Division of Vector-Borne Diseases, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, San Juan, Puerto Rico, 3 School of Engineering and Applied Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States of America

PLOS REGLECTED TROPICAL DISEASES

Interestingly, access to internet was not a good indicator of accuracy (challenging assumptions)



Table 1. Determinants of logit-transformed R² between Google Dengue Trends and government reported dengue cases: single covariate models.

	Coefficient	95% Confidence Interval	R ²	AIC ^b
Annual dengue casesª	0.61	(0.36, 0.86)	0.67	43
Minimum temperature	0.18	(-0.02, 0.37)	0.21	57
Mean temperature	0.24	(0.01, 0.47)	0.26	56
Maximum temperature	0.28	(0.02, 0.55)	0.27	56
Precipitation ^a	1.6	(0.5, 2.6)	0.44	52
Population ^a	-0.4	(-1.3, 0.6)	0.04	60
Population density	^a -0.05	(-0.9, 0.81)	0	61
Percent youth	0.2	(-0.23, 0.63)	0.07	60
Doctors per 100 k residents	0.01	(-0.01, 0.03)	0.06	60
Potable water	-0.02	(-0.12, 0.07)	0.02	61
Municipal sewage	-0.01	(-0.09, 0.06)	0.01	61
Internet access	-0.06	(-0.15, 0.03)	0.12	59
Household income	-7.2E-05	(-14.5E-05, 0.1E-05)	0.24	57

^aLog-transformed.

^bAkaike information criterion.

doi:10.1371/journal.pntd.0002713.t001

Mexico Dengue incidence (Country-level)



Jonansson et al. Submitted

Mexico Dengue incidence (Country-level)

Accuracy of predictions decreases as time horizon grows



Jonansson et al. Submitted

Mexico Dengue incidence (Country-level)

Accuracy of predictions decreases as time horizon grows



Predictions using an AR1 (constrained) model

Jonansson et al. Submitted

Forecasting Dengue Incidence in Mexico

Establishing a prediction baseline





Team:

Mauricio Santillana (BCH, Harvard), Michael Johansson (CDC Puerto Rico), Aditi Hota (Columbia Univ), John Brownstein (BCH, Harvard), Nick Reich (Umass Amherts) **Establishing a baseline**

Mexico Dengue incidence (Country-level)



а

How about higher resolution geographically? Actionable information



Jonansson et al. In preparation

Forecasting Dengue Incidence using multiple data sources









Partnerships are an essential element of this



CALL FOR PARTNERSHIPS

DEVELOPMENT OF REAL-TIME TRACKING TOOLS TO MONITOR DENGUE WORLDWIDE – HEALTHMAP & BREAK DENGUE

NICHOLAS BROOKE & MAURICIO SANTILLANA

The global incidence of dengue is estimated at 390 million cases per year worldwide [1]. Endemic in many Asian and Latin American countries, dengue has become a leading cause of hospitalization and death among children in these regions [2] and contributes to substantial economic loss for governments and households [3]. Realtime dengue surveillance, therefore, is critical for identifying areas where transmission is ongoing or methods to produce real-time and forecast estimates of flu incidence using Google search data [4,5,6], Twitter [7], Wikipedia [8], crowdsourced participatory disease surveillance tools (such as Flu Near You) [9], and clinician's databases (such as UpToDate) [10]. These methods produce real-time estimates of flu activity that closely track the flu incidence as reported by traditional public health surveillance systems, such as Influenple locations around the world by leveraging disparate data sources including: traditional clinical reporting systems, crowd sourced disease surveillance tools, internet-based services such as Google, Twitter and Wikipedia. In addition, our aim would be to empower local authorities with actionable information that may help them establish targeted alert systems to prevent further disease spread. What if we could use **news reports** as a way to modulate predictions produced with models?

An example from the Ebola outbreak in 2015

Healthmap.org


HealthMap brings together disparate data sources, including online news aggregators, eyewitness reports, expert-curated discussions and validated official reports, to achieve a unified and comprehensive view of the current global state of infectious diseases and their effect on human and animal health.



Through an automated process, updating 24/7/365, the system monitors, organizes, integrates, filters, visualizes and disseminates online information about emerging diseases in nine languages, facilitating early detection of global public health threats

BealthMap About Mobile Projects Disease Daily I f



Recent success story: Ebola outbreak identification and tracking



http://www.healthmap.org/ebola/#timeline



Home Aims & Scope Review Board Authors ↓ Resources About

2014 Ebola Outbreak: Media Events Track Changes in Observed Reproductive Number

APRIL 28, 2015 · COMMENTARY



AUTHORS

Maimuna S. Majumder Sheryl Kluberg Mauricio Santillana Sumiko Mekaru John S. Brownstein

ABSTRACT

In this commentary, we consider the relationship between early outbreak changes in the observed reproductive number of Ebola in West Africa and various media reported interventions and aggravating events. We find that media reports of interventions that provided education, minimized contact, or strengthened healthcare were typically followed by sustained transmission reductions in both Sierra Leone and Liberia. Meanwhile, media reports of aggravating events generally preceded temporary transmission increases in both countries. Given these preliminary findings, we conclude that media reported events could potentially be incorporated into future epidemic modeling efforts to improve mid-outbreak case projections.



Sierra Leone



Liberia





★ JMIR Public Health and Surveillance

Published on 01.06.16 in Vol 2, No 1 (2016): Jan-Jun

This paper is in the following e-collection/theme issue:

⊗Infoveillance, Infodemiology and Digital Disease Surveillance ⊗Infodemiology and Infoveillance



Utilizing Nontraditional Data Sources for Near Real-Time Estimation of Transmission Dynamics During the 2015-2016 Colombian Zika Virus Disease Outbreak

Maimuna S Majumder^{1,2}, MPH (D); Mauricio Santillana^{1,3,4}, PhD (D); Sumiko R Mekaru^{1,5}, PhD (D); Denise P McGinnis¹, ScD (D); Kamran Khan^{6,7}, MD (D); John S Brownstein^{1,4}, PhD (D)



With no access to traditional, government-lead disease surveillance information, we extracted the number of suspected cases as reported by **new reports** as a function of time. We then utilized the time behavior of Google searches of the word "zika" to smooth the news-reported incidence data.



When we gained access to government-lead disease surveillance information, we found great similarity with the curve we produced ahead of the publication of this information.



Thank you!

Contact: msantill@fas.harvard.edu